Appendix C

**Description and Measurement of Plot in NPF Scholarship:**

**Results & Codebook**

This appendix provides a table which uses a binary scheme to identify NPF articles and their use (1) or non-use (0) of plot dimensions within the descriptions and/or measurement of plot. The codebook adopted by reviewers can be found below the table.

Table 3. NPF scholarship use plot dimensions in definitions and measurements.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Article** | **Structure \_Def** | **Structure \_Meas** | **Valence \_Def** | **Valence \_Meas** | **Causality \_Def** | **Casuality \_Meas** |
| Ba et al., 2022 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Beck, 2018 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| Boscarino, 2018 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Boscarino, 2022 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Brekken & Fenley, 2021 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Camargo, 2020 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 |
| Chang & Kobele, 2020 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Cline, 2015 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| Cristoforetti & Querton, 2019 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Crow & Jones, 2018 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| Crow et al., 2017 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| Crow & Lawlor, 2016 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Cullerton et al., 2022 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| Dunlop et al., 2021 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| Dupuis, 2019 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 |
| Esposito et al., 2021 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| Flores et al., 2023 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Flottum & Gjerstad, 2017 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Gray & Jones, 2016 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| Guenduez & Mettler, 2023 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| Hildebrand et al., 2020 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Honeck, 2018 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| Huda, 2018 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Huda, 2019 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Huda, 2021 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| Jones, 2014 (a) | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 |
| Jones, 2014 (b) | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Jones, 2018 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Jones & Crow, 2017 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| Jones & Radaelli, 2015 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 |
| **Jones** & Song, 2014 | **1** | **1** | **0** | **1** | **0** | **0** |
| Kear & Wells, 2014 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| Knackmuhs et al., 2020 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Kuenzler, 2021 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 |
| Kuhlmann & Blum, 2021 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| Lawlor & Crow, 2018 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 |
| Lebel & Lebel, 2018 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 |
| Lin & Chung, 2020 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 |
| Mainenti, 2018 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| McBeth et al., 2016 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| McBeth et al., 2017 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| McBeth & Pearsall, 2021 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| McBeth et al., 2013 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| McBeth et al., 2010 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| McBeth et al., 2012 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| McGough et al., 2018 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Mishra, 2020 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Mosley & Gibson, 2017 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| Nisbett, 2017 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| O'Donovan, 2018 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| O'Leary et al., 2017 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| Olofsson et al., 2018 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| Palm et al., 2022 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| Peltomaa, 2018 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Peterson, 2023 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Price, 2019 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Radaelli et al., 2013 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| Rodrigues Neto & Barcelos, 2020 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 |
| Ruff et al., 2022 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Schaub, 2021 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Schlaufer, 2018 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 |
| Shanahan et al., 2014 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Shanahan et al., 2011 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Shanahan et al., 2013 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Smith-Walter et al., 2020 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Soremi, 2019 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Stephan, 2019 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Terlizzi, 2021 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| Tosun & Schaub, 2021 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Uldanov et al., 2021 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Velasco González & Ruano, 2021 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| **Veselková**, 2014 | **1** | **0** | **1** | **0** | **0** | **0** |
| Wehde & Perreault, 2022 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| Weiss, 2019 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Wendler, 2021 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Zanocco et al., 2018 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 |

Note: Even with additional intercoder reliability, this table is reliant on each article’s context, reviewer knowledge of the NPF elements, and (occasionally) implied meaning.

**Codebook**

**Instructions**

This table is divided into three (3) main categories – and each distinguish “Definition” and “Measurement” as sub-categories.

* Structure
* Valence
* Causality

Follow the below guidelines to code your assigned articles as containing (1) or not containing (0) the relevant dimensions of plot (Structure, Valence, Causality) in the article.

* **Structure**
  + \_Def: (1) Definition of plot includes a description of narrative structure
  + \_Meas: (1) Article measures, reports, or includes structure.
  + Key Concepts:
    - Structure
    - Sequence
    - Time
    - Order of events
    - Order of outcomes
    - Organizes
  + Clarifications:
    - Connections/relationships alone are not considered structure – definition must imply story progression.
    - Longitudinal studies should not be recorded as including structure; time is within the narrative (as presented by a narrator), not the real-world.
    - If plot definition or measurement includes Stone’s story typologies – record as (1). [Based on Ruff et al., 2022]
* **Valence**
  + \_Def: (1) Definition of plot includes a description or assessment of +/- connotation.
  + \_Meas: (1) Article measures, reports, or includes valence.
  + Key Concepts:
    - Drama
    - Policy Problems
    - Conflict
    - Change
    - Sentiments
    - Frames/Themes
    - Trajectories
  + Clarifications:
    - Direction is added to Key Concepts
    - Costs/Benefits must be defined as plot, not *narrative strategies* to record (1) in \_Measurement.
    - If plot definition or measurement includes Stone’s story typologies – record as (1). [Based on Ruff et al., 2022]
* **Causality**
  + \_Def: (1) Definition includes a description of cause, blame, or explanation.
  + \_Meas: (1) Article measures, reports, or includes causality as plot.
  + Key Concepts:
    - Causal
    - Blame
    - Intention
    - Explanation
    - Causal Mechanisms:
      * **This one can be tricky** – record as (1) if plot. Record as (0) if described or measured as a “narrative strategy.”
  + Clarifications:
    - Triple check yourself on causal mechanisms. Authors sometimes report plot and narrative strategies at the same time!
    - If unclear as measurement, record as 0.